

## Graduate Employment Working Group: Summer 2019

**Committee Members:** Rob Boley (WSU Foundation), Jeff Giles (WSU Athletics), Sheryl Kent (CECS), Nimisha Patel (CEHS), Thomas Rooney (COSM), Greg Scharer (Alumni Relations/Advancement), Wayne Stark (COLA/CLASS), Craig This (Institutional Research & Effectiveness), Weisong Wang (Lake), Sean Wilson (COLA).

### Background

The proposed budget for the State (HB 166) includes language that would create a “Graduate Employment Consultation Committee” tasked with identifying a means by which State Share of Instruction (SSI) can be allocated, at least in part, on the basis of the employability of a public university’s graduates. This addition to the SSI calculations could be in place as soon as the 2021-2022 academic year. Legislators will gravitate to a very simple metric and that is likely to be taxable income of graduates in Ohio, and on a very short timeline (one-year would be most likely). They will be interested in immediate payoffs/return on investment.

As per the *Study on the use of Employment Metrics for the State Share of Instruction Formulas*, The Inter-University Council and Ohio Association of Community Colleges shall each recommend eight members representing their institutions to serve on the Employment Metrics Consultation, which shall assist the Chancellor of Higher Education to study the most appropriate formula weights for post-graduation employment measures that may be used in the distribution to universities and community colleges from the foregoing appropriation item 235501, State Share of Instruction, beginning in fiscal year 2022. The Chancellor, or the Chancellor’s designee, shall lead the Consultation and call its first meeting. The Consultation shall research the most appropriate data sources available to measure employment outcomes and evaluate the public policy benefits of adding such measures to the current State Share of Instruction allocation formulas to reward institutional performance of job placement. The Consultation shall also identify and evaluate the most critical factors that should be considered as possible enhancements to the formula, such as the relevance of graduates’ degrees to job placement, employment in Ohio versus out of state, placement in high demand fields, and other qualitative factors. Separate allocation factors may be considered within each sector’s share of the foregoing appropriation item 235501, State Share of Instruction. The study shall be completed by June 30, 2020.

# Current Data Collection Practices at Wright State University

## University-Level Practices

Currently, Wright State University does report job placement rates as prescribed by HEA Sec. 487(a)(8); 34 CFR 668.14(b)(10): *If an institution uses job placement rates in their marketing material, they are required to provide certain disclosures about job placement rates. They must provide and certify the data is the most recent available, provide any other information necessary to substantiate the truthfulness of the information, and provide any state licensing requirements. In addition, an institution must provide information on the placement in employment and types of employment obtained by graduates of the institution's degree and certificate programs.*

**NACE First Destination Survey.** In order to comply, WSU utilizes the First-Destination Survey (through the Office of Career Services), which captures information regarding how new college graduates fare in their careers within six months of graduation; this is only sent to those who have graduated from undergraduate programs, and has a response rate of 7%. The annual initiative provides clear, concise, and consistent data on the outcomes associated with a college education on a national scale. Information includes (1) types of employment (e.g. full or part time, contract, freelance, etc.); (2) planned further educational endeavors (e.g., graduate school acceptance); (3) to be determined career/graduate school endeavors; and still seeking either employment or further education; and (4) and starting salary for those employed full time. <http://www.wright.edu/student-success/career-services/did-you-graduate-in-the-past-year>

## College-and Unit-Level Practices

### College of Education and Human Services

- **Educator Preparation Programs** - Upon the graduation of each cohort, all program directors attain career/salary information as available. Typically, directors collect candidates' non-WSU emails to follow-up with job status. Data form includes name, non-WSU email, school district/place of employment, specific school, grade/subject area teaching (or counseling or principalship...etc), date notified, salary. <https://education-human-services.wright.edu/about/educator-quality-data>

### College of Engineering and Computer Science

- **Department Exit Interviews** - Chairs and/or advisors conduct exit interviews with all graduating seniors. Post graduation plans documented on spreadsheet. Information is shared with the Brandeberry Career Development Center
- **Qualtrics Survey** - Distributed by advisors (after NACE) to primary non-WSU emails and via MailChimp of all CECS graduates, distributed 0, 3, 6 months post graduation.

### College Of Liberal Arts

- **Surveys** - Some COLA departments do their own outcomes data gathering - the survey methods being employed, and the data generated, need to be evaluated.
- **Alumni Employment Analysis** – This was a one-time report for **ALL COLA** academic departments, looking at employment by industry, employer, job title, and region – generated by Rob Boley in the Advancement Division.
- **Alumni Engagement Strategies - Field Major/Specific Career Events** – ex. Crime and Justice Studies, SPIA, Mod. Lang., MPA, URS, GEO, etc. – Outreach to most regional alumni seeking participation. Alumni participate in an evening of networking and panel presentations. These events feature strong alumni, faculty, and student engagement. <http://webapp2.wright.edu/web1/newsroom/2019/02/28/professionals-in-criminal-justice-share-insights-career-advice-with-wright-state-students/>
- **Internship Partners Expo** – Annual event brings in 40 internship providers, many of them alumni. <http://webapp2.wright.edu/web1/newsroom/2019/04/25/college-of-liberal-arts-internship-partners-expo-draws-a-crowd/>
- **COLA Mentoring Program** – Some Alumni involvement – alumni giving back. <http://webapp2.wright.edu/web1/newsroom/2018/04/06/mentoring-momentum/>

### Alumni Relations

- **Alumni Outreach** - Alumni Relations and Annual Giving ask for updated information in almost every communication to alumni. We will also incentivize with giveaways.
- **Alumni Survey** - Alumni survey is sent every 3-5 yrs (next 2020) to request full information update.
- **Alumni in the News** - The Advancement Division monitors news releases/online sources for employment updates related to WSU Alumni.
- **LiveAlumni LinkedIn Data** – The Advancement Division has contracted annually with vendor LiveAlumni to obtain updated LinkedIn employment data (e.g., industry, employer,

job title) on all publicly available WSU Alumni LinkedIn profiles - about 40K records. It is, however, an intensive and challenging process to match alumni with profile. Also, this data is self-reported and includes no salary information.

## **Athletics**

- **Athletics All-Athlete Reunion** - Held the last three years, around one of the biggest home basketball games of the season. We typically draw 100-150 former student-athletes, plus their families. Multiple Athletics staff members interact with attendees.
- **Sports-specific Reunions** - Held periodically around anniversaries of significant team accomplishments and, sometimes, on the interest of the coaching staff to engage former players. Range in size from 10-25 former student-athletes. Event structure will vary, and may include off-site or on-site cocktail hour, and often on-court/on-field recognition.
- **Senior Lunches** - Bob Grant meets with seniors from each program to discuss their time at WSU, ask what they'd change about their experience academically and athletically, etc.
- **Student-Athlete Survey** - An anonymous, comprehensive survey to student-athletes in spring asking for feedback (e.g., coaching staff, training staff, life skills program, academic support, etc.)

## **Benefits of Data Collected**

- Recruit prospective students
- Market success stories
- Attract stellar faculty and staff
- Attract and retain employers, internship providers, and research partners
- Match current students with potential mentors
- Identify alumni who may potentially be lucrative donors
- Better understanding of how graduates are using their degrees
- Provide students with better internship and mentoring opportunities

## **Concerns about Data Collected**

### **Accuracy Concerns**

- First job/salary post graduation may not be 3-6 months out
- Some self-reported data are skewed
- How do we house the data centrally so all can access for marketing, certifications, etc.

## **Misuse of Data Concerns**

- Used to determine which programs to continue and which to ‘sunset’
- Used to determine which programs should receive greater human and financial support

## **Other Concerns**

- Does not account for graduates who choose to attend graduate school, (e.g. medical, dental, or law school, other professional programs; doctoral programs, etc.).
- Does not account for graduates’ long-term higher salaries, especially for those who graduate from COLA and who are in community-focused careers (e.g., social work, education, community/school counseling, local/state government, non profit, etc.). These critical societal contributors’ salaries are often times not commensurate with the positive impact they have on society: locally, regionally, nationally, and globally. Studies highlighting this information are available.
- Does not account for critical skills, of particular focus in COLA, that employers have identified as ‘high need’. Employers often note that recent graduates from other academic areas do not consistently have these skills upon entering the workforce. For example, it is essential that those entering the workforce understand the value and utility of the liberal arts, how they apply to the world of work, and that they know how to communicate that value to employers. Two career advancement certificates rolling out in fall 2019 exemplify the development of these skill sets.
- Salary data ignores graduates’ social, political, and economic activism. Such work is integral for the betterment of society, but reap limited financial outcomes for graduates.
- Does not account for gap years to pursue substantive personal endeavors such as traveling or serving in Americorps, Peace Corps, etc.
- The data set should be handled properly as a tool of graduate employment assessment for college education; it should not be used as a data source inappropriately. Since it contains private information, it should be safeguarded appropriately by a designated organization within the university.
- If we rely on internal mechanisms for data collection, information management team would need to develop a centralized form and provide incentive for faculty and staff to complete.

## Possible Ways to Collect Verified Employment & Salary Data

- **Ohio Department of Job and Family Services** - Could provide up to six quarters prior data of salary information. Costs is \$.04 per record with \$500 one-time set-up fee (min. \$150 charge per run). With less than \$5000 cost, Wright State could obtain all State of Ohio alumni employment information. The data include information of employees DOB, current address, current salary, employer's name, federal ID, address, city, etc. It could be a feasible way to collect employment data for Wright State to use without limitations over the years. However, the data doesn't include federal employees information. 75% Wright State graduates are staying in Ohio. The data from the state of Ohio and Census Bureau has a good potential to help Wright State in marketing and recruitment. This would be affordable for updated annual data. Individual record-level data are provided for all of the 75% of alumni who choose to stay in Ohio. Historical data prior to most recent 6 quarters also available at \$.04/record. WSU submits' alumni SSNs.
- **Ohio State Income Tax** - Salary data collected through Job and Family Services using student name and SSN. Data would be for graduates working in Ohio only. Requires Student Release-could be signed upon admissions with FERPA form. WSU submits' alumni SSNs.
- **EMSI ([www.economicmodeling.com](http://www.economicmodeling.com))** - for a fee and WSU can send EMSI an unlimited number of record requests. Requesting information on the 80,000 or so WSU graduates would cost approximately \$13,000. However, it is estimated that accurate data will only be obtained from approximately 40% of the records requested. Data returned would include graduate's current employment title, skill set, contact information, employer information, etc.
- **National Student Clearinghouse (NSC)** - Would provide us with data on which of our graduates chose to pursue additional degrees. The information available would include: the degree level, specific majors pursued, and degrees earned. Participation in National Student Clearinghouse is not mandatory and not all institutions provide all possible data. Since NSC data files take a lot of cleaning, it's not recommended to immediately pull all 80,000 alumni records. It can start with not too far back historically then going forward. The larger window for enrolled students, the more cleaning required.

- **Wealth Analysis** - no salary data unless an insider at a private company, expensive. This was done in the past only on identified major gift prospects in the planning phase of the Rise.Shine. Campaign.
- **Equifax** - The basic package (\$66,000 for 45,000 student records) includes aggregated data with median salary by major, campus, school/college, program, region, industry, etc. over 15 years. The price for such snapshot is only for max. 5 requested variables. Optional package can be obtained for \$20K to include email, salary and employer information for individual graduate. However, since only 40% of major US employers including Wright State are contributing equifax database, it may not capture all students' employment situation. Only the data of graduates within 40% US employers is accurate and verified. The remaining information is based on modeled-data, not verified data. Obtain salary and company information based on credit vs self reported data. Support needed for longitudinal collection. Nationwide data collection. Could use a sample vs. all graduates. This practice requires Student Release to tie to individual records - could be signed upon admissions with FERPA form, otherwise aggregate. Able to gather historical salary data- before/after degree completion 3rd Party Neutral. It could benefit marketing and recruitment. No individual record data. WSU submits' alumni SSNs.

## **Committee's Recommendation**

### **External Strategies for Data Collection**

- Pursue data from the Ohio Department of Jobs and Families Services. This will allow for an affordable avenue to gather alumni employment and salary data each year (including much needed longitudinal data) at the individual record level. It will allow WSU to examine increases in salaries over time, not merely immediately after graduation. It will allow WSU to examine the long-term financial and societal impact on our various academic programs, rather than merely restricting our data to one year post-graduation. As the latest communication with ODJFS, the cost is \$1800 for 45,000 students.
- For those 25% not living in OH, is there a way to access the information from other states' databases, similar to the Ohio Jobs and Family Services database? For example, would we be able to gather data from surrounding states and the coasts, where many of these 25% of alumni have moved. If so, it would allow us to gather the largest amount of data for the lowest costs.

- Use EMSI to access contact information for 25% of WSU alumni who do not live in the State of Ohio. Given the \$13,000 cost for this, this may not be needed on an annual basis; perhaps on a 3-year cycle.
- Use National Student Clearinghouse (NSC) to determine where our students pursue additional degrees, at what level, what majors they pursue, and what degrees they have earned. We can start with names of individuals for whom we are either missing employment data and whose salaries may be commensurate with simultaneous graduate study.
- Explore the resources available to obtain the employment data for current graduates as federal employees.
- Reach out to the Department of Defense to obtain data for graduates in military service.

### **Internal Strategies for Data Collection**

- Bolster NACE First Destination Survey response rates <https://www.nacweb.org/career-development/best-practices/increasing-first-destination-survey-responses/>
- Calling campaigns, incentives for filling out surveys
- Formal exit interviews
- Graduation ceremonies/events geared toward information gathering
- Dean-encouraged departmental surveys
- Create a central portal for faculty and staff to update alumni employment/contact information