Bowling Green State University

Length of affordability and efficiency report: 20 pages

Total expected annual cost savings (M): 11.7

5-year goals

- Total institutional efficiency savings (M): 60.2
- Total new resource generation (M): 2.3
- Largest re-deployment of savings to students: Fund development of new academic programs

Collaborative contracts: Joint contracts in place for: copier/printer services, computer hardware, shipping, scientific supplies, and office supplies. Planning on contracting for: travel services.

Partnerships and sponsorships: beverage pouring rights, on-campus ATMs and banking center, athletics sponsorships.

Administrative cost reforms: provided as an attachment.

Administrative productivity measure: initial review of ODHE’s ratios suggests salaries and headcounts provided to ODHE contain errors (e.g. including graduate assistants) – corrections should improve ratios; using Lean Six Sigma to streamline advising and administrative hiring.

Data Centers: moving data recovery site to the State of Ohio Computer Center.


Textbook affordability: exploring less expensive formats for two high-volume courses (General Studies Writing and Intro to Business), course reserves in library, standing Senate committee will evaluate the methods of choosing instructional materials.

Time to degree: students are encouraged to take 15 credits per semester, 30 credits per year must be completed for renewal of institutional scholarships (including athletics), simple majority of degree programs require 124 credit hours or less.

Duplicative programs: partner with U of Toledo for four courses/programs.
Central State University

Length of affordability and efficiency report: 15 pages

Total expected annual cost savings ($M): 2.1

5-year goals
  Total institutional efficiency savings ($M): N/A (no report submitted)
  Total new resource generation ($M): N/A (no report submitted)
  Largest re-deployment of savings to students: $0.75M (direct operations)

Collaborative contracts: Joint contracts in place for: copier/printer services, computer hardware, travel services, shipping, scientific supplies, and office supplies.

Partnerships and sponsorships: none reported.

Administrative cost reforms: developing an efficiency committee to review all campus operations with Sodexo Magic; needed to streamline under Fiscal Watch declaration.

Administrative productivity measure: have outsourced HR, maintenance, water services, dining and bookstore; do not have resources to send staff to Lean Six Sigma training.

Data Centers: discussing possible more to SOCC in January, 2017.

Energy efficiency projects: have worked with Brewer Garrett Company for conservation upgrades, to regulate water drips with preventative maintenance schedules, and effect behavior changes in residence halls.

Textbook affordability: a textbook committee is meeting with the administration to develop cost saving opportunities.

Time to degree: implemented a “15X8=GradUate!” initiative, bulk tuition rate for 12 to 18 credit hours; all but two bachelor's degree requires 126 credit hours or less; Provost and President have asked University Senate to begin reviewing reduction to 120 credits for all programs.

Duplicative programs: “no programs or courses being shared with other institutions.”
Cleveland State University

Length of affordability and efficiency report: 41 pages

Total expected annual cost savings ($M): 3.5

5-year goals
  Total institutional efficiency savings ($M): N/A (no report submitted)
  Total new resource generation ($M): N/A (no report submitted)
  Largest re-deployment of savings to students: $1.9M (student scholarships)

Collaborative contracts: Joint contracts in place for: computer hardware, travel services, and office supplies. Will work with IUC for shipping and scientific supplies contracts. Cannot explore copier/printer contracts for five years.

Partnerships and sponsorships: Huntington National Bank ($1.15M total licensing fee for 10 years) and Learfield Sports Marketing ($300,000 annually).

Administrative cost reforms: cost diagnostic part of Path to 2020 initiative; 600 administrative/institutional support cost ideas being evaluated, recommending 17 investments totaling $775K for enrollment management.

Administrative productivity measure: ranked 3rd for productivity ratios; Path to 2020 initiative aims to improve efficiency; $3.5M in savings expected for FY2017 operating budget; suggests assessing productivity by total degrees awarded per $1M in operating expenditures (CSU ranks #1 at $56,735/degree).

Data Centers: received no response from SOCC regarding costs; has contract with private sector; exploring MOU with Youngstown State and/or University of Akron.

Energy efficiency projects: Normalized energy consumption has declined by a total of 24.8% over a ten year period with approximately $3M in savings annually.

Textbook affordability: several departments with large enrollment courses use older editions of textbooks; many books used for multiple terms; several faculty use Open Source books.

Time to degree: 9 enhanced completion strategies (e.g. degree maps with milestones, strengthen transfer pathways with community colleges); reduced minimum degree requirement to 120 credit hours.

Duplicative programs: Northeast Ohio MS of Fine Arts in Creative Writing (KSU, U of Akron, YSU); MS of Public Health (NEOMED, OU, YSU, U of Akron); Adult Development and Aging (U of Akron); and MS in Health Sciences (Cuyahoga CC).
Kent State University

Length of affordability and efficiency report: 34 pages

Total expected annual cost savings ($M): 13.5

5-year goals
- Total institutional efficiency savings ($M): 31.8
- Total new resource generation ($M): 5.0
- Largest re-deployment of savings to students: $4.7M (graduation incentives)

Collaborative contracts: Joint contracts in place for: computer hardware, shipping, and office supplies. Planning on contracting for: copier/printer services, travel services, and scientific supplies.

Partnerships and sponsorships: partnerships with: PNC Bank (royalty payments for ATMS and branch on campus), Pepsi ($150,000 per year for pouring rights), Barnes & Noble, and Sodexo (campus dining).

Administrative cost reforms: developed a cost analysis tool; salaries, student aid, employment benefits and capital expenses are cost drivers.

Administrative productivity measure: “ranked relatively lower than other public four-year universities”; “information may be useful in reviewing productivity”.

Data Centers: currently contracted with a managed service for Tier 1 environment even when personnel are not available; planning to relocate Tier 2 backup/recovery at SOCC in 2017.

Energy efficiency projects: anticipate reducing energy production costs by $429,000 per year over the next 15 years; procuring and hedging natural gas purchases to better control costs; negotiated 13% lower rates for electricity.

Textbook affordability: beginning to negotiate deals with book companies for 14 courses with enrollments over 1,000.

Time to degree: students are encouraged to take 15 credits per semester; students taking less than 15 credits in a semester get an email from Provost; most bachelor’s degrees can be completed within 126 credit hours or less.

Duplicative programs: partner with U of Akron, NEOMED, Youngstown State, Cleveland Clinic, and Cleveland State (for at total of six BS, MS, PhD and MD degrees), and several out-of-state institutions (for two different associate degrees).
Miami University

Length of affordability and efficiency report: 20 pages

Total expected annual cost savings ($M): 6.7

5-year goals
  Total institutional efficiency savings ($M): 42.3
  Total new resource generation ($M): 24.2
  Largest re-deployment of savings to students ($M): 31.8 (UG financial aid)

Collaborative contracts: Joint contracts in place for: copier/printer services, computer hardware, shipping, and office supplies. Planning on contracting for: travel services, and scientific supplies.

Partnerships and sponsorships: public radio station, software company, beverage pouring rights, health services, athletics sponsorships.

Administrative cost reforms: detailed cost diagnostic with outliers identified.

Administrative productivity measure: will use ODHE’s ratios as part of its approach to monitoring its progress; implemented Lean Six Sigma in 2009 (completed 864 projects valued at $42.3M).

Data Centers: participating with IUC in the development of best-fit criteria.

Energy efficiency projects: using FY2008 as a baseline, 28% decrease in energy consumption in FY2015 and 34% in FY2016 ($2.7M in savings).

Textbook affordability: reviewing proposals for a provider of online textbooks, an Open Educational Resources Committee is developing recommendations for greater standardization of course materials for gateway courses.

Time to degree: students can perform degree audits, tuition and fees are fixed over four years, flat tuition rate begins at 12 credit hours, most bachelor’s degree programs can be completed within 126 credit hours, has no plans for competency-based degree programs.

Duplicative programs: classics program in a virtual classroom with Ohio University.
NEOMED (Northeast Ohio Medical University)

Length of affordability and efficiency report: 27 pages

Total expected annual cost savings ($M): N/A

5-year goals
   Total institutional efficiency savings ($M): 4.9
   Total new resource generation ($M): 36.7
   Largest re-deployment of savings to students ($M): no response given.

Collaborative contracts: proposing a service center (that centralizes common core business operations) that is a private entity created by a coalition of public universities from northeast Ohio.

Partnerships and sponsorships: partnerships with: Kent State, Akron General Hospital, Summa Health System, Cleveland State, University of Akron, Mercy Health System, and Medical Mutual of Ohio.

Administrative cost reforms: analysis has not been completed.

Administrative productivity measure: ODHE determined that NEOMED would not be included in this measure.

Data Centers: institution does not have a disaster recovery data center site and has no budget to deploy one; recommendation is out of step with strategic vision; moving email to a full cloud 365 solution.

Energy efficiency projects: “None.”

Textbook affordability: no response given.

Time to degree: no response given.

Duplicative programs: no response given.
Ohio State University

Length of affordability and efficiency report: 26 pages

Total expected annual cost savings ($M): 124.1

5-year goals
  Total institutional efficiency savings ($M): N/A (no report submitted)
  Total new resource generation ($M): N/A (no report submitted)
  Largest re-deployment of savings to students ($M): N/A (financial aid)

Collaborative contracts: Joint contracts in place for: computer hardware, and shipping. Planning on contracting for: copier/printer services, travel services, and scientific supplies. No plans to contract for office supplies beyond that of IUC purchasing group.

Partnerships and sponsorships: partnerships with: Nike (total value of $252M), Huntington (15-year, $25M), Nationwide (10-year, $17.1M), J. America/Lids (10-year, $97M), Coca-Cola (10-year, $33M), and UnitedLex (3 to 5 residencies for law school graduates each year).

Administrative cost reforms: addressing cost drivers through a strategic procurement process that has saved $190M over the past five years.

Administrative productivity measure: compares well to similar institutions nationally (14th of 30 large land-grant universities); concerned that ODHE's metrics "would be misleading for anyone seeking to make comparisons"; OSU is unique.

Data Centers: saved $40M in capital costs by moving central data systems to SOCC in 2014.

Energy efficiency projects: reduced energy utilization in five high-use buildings by 30%; savings of at least $45,000 through Marion campus efficiencies.

Textbook affordability: specifies textbooks for courses at least two weeks before online registration begins, working with Barnes & Noble to identify best practices for lowering student costs; developed online version of most popular gen-ed courses.

Time to degree: tuition structure (bulk rate for 12 to 18 credit hours) provides a significant financial incentive for students to take full course loads; 99% of undergraduate programs require the university's minimum of 121 semester hours.

Duplicative programs: continuous evaluation of offerings at its four regional campuses.
Ohio University

Length of affordability and efficiency report: 23 pages

Total expected annual cost savings ($M): 10.1 (not directly reported; taken from five-year goals)

5-year goals
- Total institutional efficiency savings ($M): 4.4
- Total new resource generation ($M): 8.9
- Largest re-deployment of savings to students ($M): 7.4 (Elearning)

Collaborative contracts: Joint contracts in place for: copier/printer services, computer hardware, travel services, shipping, scientific supplies, and office supplies.

Partnerships and sponsorships: various partnerships in athletics, academics and alumni relations (Athletics: Ohio Health, Pepsi, and Russell; Alumni: MetLife, Comenity National Bank, and Nationwide Insurance; no specific academics or values provided).

Administrative cost reforms: Deteriorated facilities have increased operating costs due to costly repairs, energy inefficiencies, etc. A cost diagnostic suggests that overall the institution is more efficient than in the past (values not provided).

Administrative productivity measure: faces challenges due to limited classifications for current administrators. Lack of granularity makes it difficult to analyze administrative productivity. Considering development of a lean institute.

Data Centers: invested in its own data center two years ago; a move would cost an estimated $5M; have reciprocal agreement with Wright State for backups (saving $80,000 per year); considering cloud service alternatives.

Energy efficiency projects: Steam/Condensate distribution maintenance ($110K and $750K in water and energy cost savings, respectively, relative to 2015), installation of energy efficient equipment ($138K in rebates), 50% of electricity purchases from renewable sources, and natural gas used for heating instead of coal (12% greater efficiency).

Textbook affordability: supporting faculty integration of licensed library materials, incentivizing faculty to adopt open source materials, promoting course redesign; anticipating a 15% savings for students ($2M).

Time to degree: students are encouraged to take a full load of classes; most degrees at 120 credit hours (exceptions are due to accreditation issues).

Duplicative programs: 73 agreements with community colleges.
University of Akron

Length of affordability and efficiency report: 22 pages

Total expected annual cost savings ($M): N/A

5-year goals
- Total institutional efficiency savings ($M): 2.6
- Total new resource generation ($M): 5.1
- Largest re-deployment of savings to students ($M): no response given.

Collaborative contracts: Joint contracts in place for: printer/copier services, shipping, scientific and office supplies. Planning on contracting for: computer hardware, and travel services.

Partnerships and sponsorships: partnerships with: Coca Cola (pouring), Bureau of the Visually Impaired (vending), and IMG (sports marketing).

Administrative cost reforms: developed an “all funds” revenue and expense report to identify areas of fiscal strengths and opportunities.

Administrative productivity measure: 20 employees have been trained as LEAN Champions to reduce errors and to reduce costs and increase transparency in hiring.

Data Centers: enhancing primary data center and establishing a disaster recovery center at Youngstown State as part of a reciprocity agreement.

Energy efficiency projects: deferred maintenance, energy conservation measures and lab upgrades will result in a 25% reduction of electrical consumption and 35% reduction in natural gas consumption ($3.2M annual savings).

Textbook affordability: selected external vendor in 2014 with an emphasis on lowering student costs; encouraging publishers to offer more rental titles (from 40% to now 60%).

Time to degree: students are encouraged to “Finish in Time,” a communications and marketing strategy; bulk rate tuition applies for 12 to 18 credit hours. 28.5% of degrees require 120 credit hours, 3.8% require 121 to 126, and 67.7% require 127 to 152 credit hours.

Duplicative programs: partnerships for degrees in Psychology, Audiology, Speech-Language Pathology, Nursing, Sociology, and Engineering with several public universities in Ohio (including Youngstown State, Cleveland State, University of Toledo, University of Cincinnati, Bowling Green, Ohio State, and Kent State).
University of Cincinnati

Length of affordability and efficiency report: 21 pages

Total expected annual cost savings ($M): N/A (“not quantifiable”)

5-year goals
  Total institutional efficiency savings ($M): 27.0
  Total new resource generation ($M): 0
  Largest re-deployment of savings to students ($M): 1.5 (need-based aid)

Collaborative contracts: Joint contracts in place for: office supplies. Planning on contracting for: copier/printer services, computer hardware, travel services, shipping, and scientific supplies.

Partnerships and sponsorships: 1,500 students earn $62M through Co-op employment; Live Well Collaborative with Proctor & Gamble innovation center; partnership with UnderArmour for equipment and branding; up to $100,000 for scholarships through partnership with Marathon Corporation.

Administrative cost reforms: evaluating findings of benchmarking by Huron.

Administrative productivity measure: Benchmarking performance against peer institutions; pausing before filling open positions.

Data Centers: first institution to partner with SOCC in 2015.

Energy efficiency projects: 23 projects listed including: waste heat recovery generation certification producing and selling $300,000 in FY 2016; replaced MH lighting with LED throughout building (461 bulbs); and increased insulation for PCP and McMicken Roofs.

Textbook affordability: Division for Administration and Finance negotiates directly with publishers on behalf of 44,000 students, saving each student an average of $153.00.

Time to degree: fully updated Degree Audits; students are advised during Orientation to complete 30 credit hours a year; implemented a “15 to Finish” campaign. All degrees can be completed with 126 credit hours or less.

Duplicative programs: building a relationship with Miami University to share language (Hebrew and Russian) instruction using synchronous courses accessed by conferencing technology.
University of Toledo

Length of affordability and efficiency report: 42 pages

Total expected annual cost savings ($M): N/A ("See Master Recommendation 2")

5-year goals
- Total institutional efficiency savings ($M): 11.4
- Total new resource generation ($M): 181.9 (50-year agreement with ProMedica Health System: $180.2M)
- Largest re-deployment of savings to students ($M): 1 (reduce budget deficit)

Collaborative contracts: Joint contracts in place for: computer hardware, shipping, scientific supplies, and office supplies. Planning on contracting for: copier/printer services, and travel services.

Partnerships and sponsorships: entered into a 50-year academic affiliation agreement with ProMedica Health System with $50M in academic support over the life of the agreement for recruitment of faculty and student scholarships.

Administrative cost reforms: detailed cost diagnostic report covered the period of FY2008 to FY2015; reducing administrative costs through combing academic colleges and consolidating administrative leadership positions; many vacant positions eliminated.

Administrative productivity measure: ODHE’s measures suggest that consolidation of administrative positions are yielding results in both efficiency and productivity; employed Lean Six Sigma.

Data Centers: uses to internal data centers, moving toward cloud applications, considering SOCC for disaster recovery in FY2018.

Energy efficiency projects: 11 projects listed including: infrastructure, electrical capacitor bank replacement, and building automation system upgrades.

Textbook affordability: recommending new provost define a role for a professional negotiator in accord with agreements with Barnes & Noble.

Time to degree: increasing the number of times the “15 to Finish” is delivered; plateau pricing changed from 12-16 to 12-18 in fall 2016; programs being reviewed for change to 120-126 credit hour degrees.

Duplicate programs: four programs listed: Nursing (BGSU), Engineering Technology (Lorain CC), MS of Public Health (BGSU), and Police Academy (Owens CC).
**Wright State University**

**Length of affordability and efficiency report:** 24 pages

**Total expected annual cost savings ($M):** N/A (being evaluated)

**5-year goals**
- Total institutional efficiency savings ($M): 0.9
- Total new resource generation ($M): 12.4
- Largest re-deployment of savings to students ($M): N/A (will be evaluated upon completion of FY 2016)

**Collaborative contracts:** Joint contracts in place for: copier/printer services, computer hardware, shipping and office supplies. Planning on contracting for: travel, and scientific supplies.

**Partnerships and sponsorships:** exploring partnership with Sinclair Community College for child care development center; on-going partnerships with Wright-Patt Credit Union, Student Legal Services, Inc., and Pepsi.

**Administrative cost reforms:** a Dashboard diagnostic template is being developed; full review of personnel costs is underway.

**Administrative productivity measure:** 204 of 1,237 positions counted as administrators in the productivity measure were not actually administrative positions; independently reviewing all administrative positions to assess alignment with University priorities.

**Data Centers:** transfer to SOCC would add one-time and continuing expenses; WSU's own data center is recently upgraded and hosts 17 other institutions for disaster recovery.

**Energy efficiency projects:** using FY 2012 as a baseline with $5.2M in energy costs now at $4.1M for FY 2015.

**Textbook affordability:** exploring limited use licenses administered through library for eBook versions of textbooks for high-volume, high-cost courses.

**Time to degree:** students are encouraged to take 15 credit hours per semester; students who take at least 30 credit hours in a year get discounted summer tuition; all undergraduate degree programs have been re-aligned to require 120 credit hours.

**Duplicative programs:** MS of social work program shared with Miami University; Doctorate of Nursing Practice shared with University of Toledo; certificate in cyber-security with Cuyahoga Community College.
Youngstown State University

Length of affordability and efficiency report: 20 pages

Total expected annual cost savings ($M): N/A (“cannot be reasonably estimated”)

5-year goals
- Total institutional efficiency savings ($M): 20.4
- Total new resource generation ($M): 7.7
- Largest re-deployment of savings to students ($M): 17.5 (institutional investment in student aid/scholarships; no clear redeployments)

Collaborative contracts: Joint contracts in place for: shipping and office supplies. Planning on contracting for: copier/printer services, computer hardware, and scientific supplies. Plan to continue to use locally-negotiated contract for travel.

Partnerships and sponsorships: Mercy Health System partnership shares physical and intellectual resources; new PNC Bank partnership provides treasury management services for YSU operations and workplace banking for YSU community.

Administrative cost reforms: has not produced a cost diagnostic but will evaluate best practices for this type of diagnostic tool in collaboration with other Ohio universities.

Administrative productivity measure: YSU continues to hold the line on filling administrative position vacancies and has held administrative salaries flat; implementing a major organizational restructuring.

Data Centers: transfer to SOCC would result in an immediate increase in costs.

Energy efficiency projects: FY 2016 is terminal year of a 10-year energy conservation project with Johnson Controls Inc. to replace electrical and lighting fixtures; beginning construction of a steam plant on campus that will reduce energy costs by $2M annually.

Textbook affordability: students have free access to all textbooks in the library in three-hour increments; outsourcing campus bookstore to Barnes & Noble.

Time to degree: students are encouraged to take 15 credit hours per semester; bulk tuition rate extended from 17 to 18 credit hours; many departments have reduced the number of credit hours to graduate to the minimum required – 120 credits.

Duplicative programs: four programs are shared with Lorain and Lakeland Community Colleges; one program shared with Otterbein University.